

"A brilliant book . . . . It's like a membership card in the academic club."

— Eileen Seifert, DePaul University

The Moves That Matter in  
Academic Writing

They Say

2E

I Say

WITH READINGS

GERALD GRAFF  
CATHY BIRKENSTEIN  
RUSSEL DURST

# "THEY SAY / I SAY"

*The Moves That Matter  
in Academic Writing*

**WITH READINGS**

Second Edition



**GIFT OF THE ASIA FOUNDATION  
NOT FOR RE-SALE**

**QUÀ TẶNG CỦA QUỸ CHÂU Á  
KHÔNG ĐƯỢC BÁN LẠI**



# "THEY SAY / I SAY"

*The Moves That Matter  
in Academic Writing*

**WITH READINGS**

Second Edition



**GERALD GRAFF**

*University of Illinois at Chicago*

**CATHY BIRKENSTEIN**

*University of Illinois at Chicago*

**RUSSEL DURST**

*University of Cincinnati*



W · W · NORTON & COMPANY

NEW YORK    LONDON

To the great rhetorician Wayne Booth,  
who cared deeply  
about the democratic art  
of listening closely to what others say.

PREFACE

PREFACE TO "THEY SAY / I SAY"

INTRODUCTION

ENTERING THE CONVERSATION

1. "THEY SAY"

1.1 "THEY SAY"

1.1.1 Learning with What Others Are Saying

1.1.2 "His Points Is"

The Art of Summarizing

1.1.3 "He's the Missile Bureaucrat"

The Art of Quoting

2. "I SAY"

2.1 "Yes / No / Okay, But"

Using "Yes" to Respond

2.2 "And Yes"

Developing Your Own Position: How to Argue

# CONTENTS



**PREFACE** xv

**PREFACE TO "THEY SAY / I SAY"** xix

**INTRODUCTION** 1

*Entering the Conversation*

**1 "THEY SAY"** 17

**ONE "THEY SAY"** 19

*Starting with What Others Are Saying*

**TWO "HER POINT IS"** 30

*The Art of Summarizing*

**THREE "AS HE HIMSELF PUTS IT"** 42

*The Art of Quoting*

**2 "I SAY"** 53

**FOUR "YES / NO / OKAY, BUT"** 55

*Three Ways to Respond*

**FIVE "AND YET"** 68

*Distinguishing What You Say from What They Say*



## CONTENTS

SIX **"SKEPTICS MAY OBJECT"** 78

*Planting a Naysayer in Your Text*

SEVEN **"SO WHAT? WHO CARES?"** 92

*Saying Why It Matters*

**3 TYING IT ALL TOGETHER** 103

EIGHT **"AS A RESULT"** 105

*Connecting the Parts*

NINE **"AIN'T SO / IS NOT"** 121

*Academic Writing Doesn't Mean  
Setting Aside Your Own Voice*

TEN **"BUT DON'T GET ME WRONG"** 129

*The Art of Metacommentary*

**4 ENTERING THE CONVERSATION** 139

ELEVEN **"I TAKE YOUR POINT"** 141

*Entering Class Discussions*

TWELVE **"WHAT'S MOTIVATING THIS WRITER?"** 145

*Reading for the Conversation*

THIRTEEN **"ANALYZE THIS"** 156

*Writing in the Social Sciences*

Contents

**READINGS** 175

**FOURTEEN IS HIGHER EDUCATION  
WORTH THE PRICE?** 177

ANDREW HACKER AND CLAUDIA DREIFUS,  
*Are Colleges Worth the Price of Admission?* 179

SANFORD J. UNGAR, *The New Liberal Arts* 190

DAVID FOSTER WALLACE, *Kenyon Commencement Speech* 198

LIZ ADDISON, *Two Years Are Better Than Four* 211

KEVIN CAREY, *Why Do You Think They're Called  
For-Profit Colleges?* 215

CHARLES MURRAY, *Are Too Many People Going to College?* 222

MIKE ROSE, *Blue-Collar Brilliance* 243

ROBIN WILSON, *A Lifetime of Student Debt? Not Likely* 256

**FIFTEEN IS POP CULTURE ACTUALLY GOOD  
FOR YOU?** 275

STEVEN JOHNSON, *Watching TV Makes You Smarter* 277

DANA STEVENS, *Thinking Outside the Idiot Box* 295

ANTONIA PEACOCKE, *Family Guy and Freud* 299

MALCOLM GLADWELL, *Small Change:  
Why the Revolution Will Not Be Tweeted* 312

DENNIS BARON, *Reforming Egypt in 140 Characters?* 329

DAVID CRYSTAL, *2b or Not 2b?* 335

ROZ CHAST, *The I.M.s of Romeo and Juliet* 347

TOM BISSELL, *Extra Lives: Why Video Games Matter* 349



CONTENTS

JASON ZINSER, *The Good, the Bad, and The Daily Show* 363

GERALD GRAFF, *Hidden Intellectualism* 380

SIXTEEN **IS FAST FOOD THE NEW TOBACCO?** 389

DAVID ZINCZENKO, *Don't Blame the Eater* 391

RADLEY BALKO, *What You Eat Is Your Business* 395

JUDITH WARNER, *Junking Junk Food* 400

WIL HAYGOOD, *Kentucky Town of Manchester  
Illustrates National Obesity Crisis* 406

MICHELLE OBAMA, *Remarks to the NAACP* 417

MICHAEL POLLAN, *Escape from the Western Diet* 434

MARY MAXFIELD, *Resisting the Moralization of Eating* 442

SUSIE ORBACH, *Fat Is a Feminist Issue* 448

CARRIE PACKWOOD FREEMAN AND DEBRA MERSKIN,  
*Having It His Way: The Construction of Masculinity  
in Fast-Food TV Advertising* 454

SEVENTEEN **WHY DOES IT MATTER**

**WHO WINS THE BIG GAME?** 481

MAYA ANGELOU, *Champion of the World* 484

WILFRID SHEED, *Why Sports Matter* 489

MICHAEL KIMMELMAN, *Women Who Hit Very Hard  
and How They've Changed Tennis* 512

JENNIE YABROFF, *In Defense of Cheering* 524

FELISA ROGERS, *How I Learned to Love Football* 529



## Contents

- SARA MARATTA, *Move Over Boys, Make Room in the Crease* 537
- WILLIAM MOLLER, *We, the Public, Place the Best Athletes on Pedestals* 545
- JOE POSNANSKI, *Cheating and CHEATING* 553
- EIGHTEEN WHAT'S UP WITH THE AMERICAN DREAM?** 561
- BOB HERBERT, *Hiding from Reality* 564
- CAL THOMAS, *Is the American Dream Over?* 568
- BRANDON KING, *The American Dream: Dead, Alive, or on Hold?* 572
- ROBERT H. FRANK, *Income Inequality: Too Big to Ignore* 580
- PAUL KRUGMAN, *Confronting Inequality* 586
- KAREN OLSSON, *Up Against Wal-Mart* 606
- SEBASTIAN MALLABY, *Progressive Wal-Mart. Really.* 620
- CONSTANCE M. RUZICH AND A. J. GRANT, *Predatory Lending and the Devouring of the American Dream* 624
- BARACK OBAMA, *A More Perfect Union* 647
- PERMISSIONS ACKNOWLEDGMENTS** 665
- ACKNOWLEDGMENTS** 671
- INDEX OF TEMPLATES** 681
- INDEX OF AUTHORS AND TITLES** 697